Increasing Women's Access to Skilled Pregnancy Care in Nigeria: Results achieved

Nigerian Research Days for Maternal, Newborn and Child Health (MNCH) Conference

July 11-13, 2018
Outline

• Background
• Project Goal and specific objectives
• Some research questions
• Descriptive Research
• Intervention Activities
• Strengths and Limitation
• Conclusion
Background

• Nigeria has one of the highest maternal mortality rates in the world.

• The country’s estimated annual 58,000 maternal deaths account for about 19% of the global total (WHO, 2015)

• A major reason for these deaths is that many women — particularly in rural areas — don’t attend primary health centres for antenatal care, post-natal care, and giving birth.
Background

• The Government of Nigeria has made maternal and child health a priority, and the country’s 33,000 primary health centres are central to its strategy.

• PHCs are the entry door into the entire health system in Nigeria.

• In 2017, the government launched a plan to revitalize more than 10,000 of these centres especially in rural areas.
Thus, this research funded through the Innovating for Maternal and Child Health in Africa initiative is designed to generate empirical evidence to support this revitalization effort of the FMOH with evidence-based recommendations.
To strengthen the availability and access to maternal primary health care services by rural most-at-risk and vulnerable women.
Specific Objectives

• To explore why women use or do not use PHCs for maternal health care in two LGAs in Edo State, Nigeria;

• To implement a series of multi-faceted interventions for improving the demand and use of PHCs for skilled pregnancy care in the LGAs; and

• To test the effectiveness of the interventions in improving women’s use of evidence-based primary maternal services by comparing MCH outcome indicators before and after the interventions.
Some Research Questions

• What demand and supply factors are responsible for poor utilization of maternal and perinatal services at the primary health care level in Nigeria?

• What constellation of interventions would increase women’s access to primary maternal and perinatal services?

• How may these interventions be scaled up within existing health care system in Nigeria?
Project Design

• Implementation Plan
• Formative Research Phase
• Multi-stakeholders’ design of intervention phase
• Intervention activities
• Monitoring and Evaluation and reporting
**Formative Research Phase**

- **Approach** - mixed method
- **Location**: 20 randomly selected communities in two rural LGAs in Edo State – Esan South East & Etsako East
- **Qualitative methods**
  - 19 Community conversations
  - 20 Focus Group Discussions with men and women in union
  - 16 KII with Heads of PHCs, policy makers & women leaders
- **Quantitative methods**
  - Household Survey – 1408 women in union aged 15-45 years
  - Exit Interviews - 179
  - Site Assessment – 12 PHCs
Community Conversation in Esan South East
Community Conversation in Etsako East
Household Survey

• With 1408 women in union aged 15-45 years currently pregnant or have a child under 5 years
Exit Interviews – 179 women
Focus Group Discussion with women
Site Assessment
Completed activities & Outputs – Baseline

- Place of Delivery - Recent Births (n=1314)

- 62.1% of currently pregnant women were receiving ANC.
- Of this 62.1%, the majority (82.9%) use the PHC in their communities or a nearby community.
- Most recent birth - 46.6% gave birth in a PHC
- 24.8% gave birth at home or with a TBA
Completed activities & Outputs – Who are the most likely to use a PHC in the rural communities?

**Education**
- Women with higher education less likely to use a PHC than those with lower or no level of education

**Religion**
- Muslims more likely than Christians

**Autonomy**
- Women with less autonomy were more likely to use a PHC
Completed activities & Outputs – Barriers to Utilization

**Accessibility**
- Poor roads
- Lack of safe and affordable transportation
- Long distances

**Perceived Poor quality of care**
- Inadequate drugs & consumables
- Abusive care by health providers
- Providers not in sufficient numbers
- Providers not always available
- Long waiting time
- Inappropriate referral

**Cost of services**
- Inability to pay even when cost is not excessive
- Introduction of informal payments by staff

**PHC environment/facilities**
**Completed activities & Outputs - Patient Satisfaction (Exit Interview)**

(Overall, would you say you are satisfied with your experience in this hospital)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Not satisfied</th>
<th>Fairly satisfied</th>
<th>Uncertain</th>
<th>Satisfied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>All</strong></td>
<td>42.5</td>
<td>44.1</td>
<td>38.7</td>
<td>41.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Esan South East</strong></td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Etsako East</strong></td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Not satisfied</th>
<th>Fairly satisfied</th>
<th>Uncertain</th>
<th>Satisfied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>All</strong></td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Esan South East</strong></td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Etsako East</strong></td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Completed activities & Outputs – Site Assessment

- **FMoH STANDARD:** Walls and roof in good condition with functional doors and netted windows

- **Some Comments**
  - not in good condition
  - spoilt window nets
  - termite window
  - not adequate
  - dilapidated state

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ESAN SOUTH EAST LGA</th>
<th>ETSAKO EAST LGA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Available</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Available</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Adequate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- **FMoH STANDARD:**
  Functional separate male and female toilet facilities with water supply within the premises

- **Some Comments**
  - need toilets
  - no direct borehole
  - bad toilet condition
  - not adequate
  - one toilet no water

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ESAN SOUTH EAST LGA</th>
<th>ETSAKO EAST LGA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Available</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Available</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Adequate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**FMoH STANDARD:**
A clean water source from a motorized borehole

**Some Comments**
- not functioning
- water from river

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ESAN SOUTH EAST LGA</th>
<th>ETSAKO EAST LGA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Available</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Available</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Adequate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Publications

Published


Submitted for Publication

• Gender inequality as barrier to women’s access to skilled pregnancy care in rural Nigeria: A qualitative study. Frontiers in Public Health
• A qualitative study of non-utilisation of skilled pregnancy care in rural Nigeria. Women and Birth.
• Men’s Perception of Barriers to Women’s Use and Access of Skilled Pregnancy Care In Rural Nigeria: A Qualitative Study.
Accepted Conference Abstracts

• Building community-led interventions for demand creation for skilled pregnancy care in rural Nigeria. 5th Global Symposium on Health Systems Research, Liverpool, UK. Abstract ID: 1537. Accepted.

• Why women do not use Primary Health Centres for skilled pregnancy care in rural Nigeria: Evidence from a mixed method study 5th Global Symposium on Health Systems Research, Liverpool, UK. Abstract ID: 1541 Accepted.

• “I don’t think family planning is helping women rather it is “killing” many women”: Uncovering persistent ignorance and misconceptions about family planning in rural Nigeria. International Conference on Family Planning. International Conference on Family Planning, Kigali Rwanda. Abstract (ID 1166) Accepted.
Huge amount of resources were put into data production: Fund, time and energy to mention but few.

Documentation and preservation of Microdata is more critical than ever.

The old model of just producing tables in a survey report is becoming more antiquated as the distinction between programmer and analyst is blurred.

Metadata is data that clarifies the process of planning, implementing and executing the survey.
Completed activities & Outputs - Archiving

• Typically, datasets are documented after completion of the surveys. At that stage, it is however often too late to capture all the metadata information produced during the life cycle of data collection activity hence, we document as we generate the data.

• International Household Surveys Network (IHSN) Metadata toolkit was used to document the metadata where data can be written on a CD-Rom (or web site)

• We also customizing the layout (branding) and content of the CD
Completed activities & Outputs - Archiving

- **Metadata Editor** – Allows the user to add survey metadata and create the ddi.xml and outputs file in NESSTAR format for browsing and accessing data.

- **CD-ROM Builder** – Allows the user to generate HTML output from the study that can be published on a CD or the internet for dissemination.
Intervention Design and Planning

- Workshop for the dissemination of the formative research findings and intervention planning
- Meetings with project communities
- Meetings with key agencies – Edo State PHCDA, Ministry of Health, and NGOs
Intervention Activities

two randomly selected wards (1 in each LGA)

- Advocacy
- Community Demand creation through WDC
- Retraining & Retooling of PHC staff
Community Engagement: Addressing Transportation

- MOU with Taxi drivers Association
- Transportation to PHC and referral hospital
- Vigilante vehicle made available for emergencies in Okpekpe kingdom
- Use of RapidSMS system
- Linkage of PHCs to referral facilities through SMS
Addressing Accessibility – The RAPID SMS system

- Emergency cases
- Links the woman to PHC and transporters through the WDC
- Uses short code
- No fee charge to the woman
Addressing Poor quality of care: Drug Revolving Fund (DRF)

- WDCs and heads of the PHC facilities have been trained on DRF management
- Trainer - The Drug Revolving Consultant, Pharm Egiebor O. Boris, Director of Pharmacy, Edo State Hospital Management Board.
- Edo State PHCDA has also assisted in identifying the drugs from the Essential drug list
- The drugs have been purchased and the DRF is working.
Elements of DRF

Drug Management Cycle.

Selection

Procurement

Use

Storage and Distribution

MANAGEMENT SUPPORT
Organization financing
Information Management
Human Resources
Addressing cost of care - Community Health Insurance ("Esusu")

• Igho Omon” – contributory fund for maternal and child health care
• Launched March 31 in both LGAs
• Accounts opened
• Administration of fund by WDC
• Monthly contribution of N100 per family
Addressing cost of care - Community Health Insurance – Esusu card

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OKPEKPE COMMUNITY</th>
<th>PHONE NUMBERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DRIVER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Tunde Kabor</td>
<td>07035834509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Chief Matthew Ugo</td>
<td>07030905539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Mr. Sunday Eko</td>
<td>08032119725</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EBELLE COMMUNITY</th>
<th>PHONE NUMBERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DRIVER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Mr. Friday Egbona</td>
<td>08060536328</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REFERRAL CENTRES FOR OKPEKPE/EBELLE COMMUNITIES.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) General Hospital, Auchi – 07034940928.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Favour Hospital, Afashio, Uzairue – 07026136282.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EWATTO, EGUARE COMMUNITY</th>
<th>PHONE NUMBERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DRIVER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Jerome Abie</td>
<td>07038911837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Igli Lucky</td>
<td>08162692986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Clement Eguavon</td>
<td>08167135191</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EWATTO, UHOMEBOHO COMMUNITY</th>
<th>PHONE NUMBERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DRIVER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Akhere Eromi</td>
<td>08108151496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Philip Elmhebelon</td>
<td>080213382881</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REFERRAL CENTRES FOR EGUARE/UHOMEBOHO COMMUNITIES.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) General Hospital, Okaigbe, Ewohimi – 07038538424.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Dr. Ugbo Clinic, Eguare, Ewohimi – 08062548783.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Women’s Health and Action Research Centre in collaboration with International Development Research Centre
**WHARC/IDRC IMPLEMENTATION RESEARCH PROJECT**  
Community-Based Health Insurance Scheme Card

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preferred Health Center</th>
<th>Okpekpe Primary Health Centre, Okpekpe ( ) Estako East LGA Tel: 08147053743</th>
<th>Ewatto Primary Health Centre I ( ) Esan South East LGA Tel: 08139511889</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ebelle Primary Health Centre, Ebelle ( ) Estako East LGA Tel: 07068323986</td>
<td>Ewatto Primary Health Centre II ( ) Esan South East LGA Tel: 08081413786</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Client</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Address</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phone no</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husband/Partner’s Name &amp; Phone no</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Next of Kin’s Name &amp; Phone no</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDC Chairman’s Name / Tel. no</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDC Secretary’s Name / Tel. no</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**WHARC’s Contact** 09090327831, 08023272209, 08023347828.

**HEALTH INSURANCE CONTRIBUTION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Jan</th>
<th>Feb</th>
<th>Mar</th>
<th>Apr</th>
<th>May</th>
<th>June</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sept</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ANTENATAL VISIT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Visit</th>
<th>Next appointment Date</th>
<th>Remark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Community engagement – community health education

• Regular community health talk - ongoing
• Visits to communities in Okpekpe kingdom, including by a team led by the wife of the traditional ruler and the WDC
• Visits to Ewatto community
Health education on Okpekpe day

[Image of two older women holding a sign about a primary healthcare center]
Okpekpe day Activities
Project Launching at Ewatto
Advocacy visit to Edo State Deputy Governor
Addressing Quality of Care: Advocacy

Advocacy team visit to the Chairman, Edo State Local Government Service Commission (LGSC):

- Request for posting of two Nurses/Midwives to each of the PHCs the 4 project PHCs
- Support WHARC’s in posting of NYSC (Corper) Doctors to the two LGAs - one doctor has been posted to Ward 10 Etsako East.
Addressing Quality of Care - Retraining and retooling

- Supply of consumables – Mama kits, etc. – on-going
- Training of PHC health workers:
  - Respectful care
  - Algorithms, reminders etc.
  - Include planning, budget and management skills
  - Practical simulated clinical skills package
  - Respectful care
  - Possibility of setting up outreach services
  - Record keeping
  - Effective referral
Addressing Quality of Care & PHC Environment - Advocacy

• Provision of equipment
  – Advocacy with the government – on-going
  – WHARC donation of mattress, pillows, bed sheets, etc
  – Okpekpe traditional ruler donated a generator and refrigerator to one of the PHCs

• Repair/renovation of PHC Buildings
  – Donation of One Million, Five Hundred Thousand Naira by the Okpekpe Palace as support for the project. The money was specifically dedicated to renovation of a section of the PHC for Doctors residence
  – Renovation completed.
Stakeholders’ Commitment

**WHARC**
Equipping PHCs
Funds donation to Esusu fund & DRF
Part payment of salary to youth corp doctor

**LGA & Ministry of LG**
Part payment of salary to youth corp doctor
Increased # of nurses/midwives in PHCs

**Local Community**
Donation to the Esusu by community persons and groups
Donation of N1.5 million for the renovation of Doctors’ quarters
Donation to the establishment of the DRF
Donation of a generator to the PHC in Okpekpe
Donation of a project vehicle to transport pregnancy women during emergencies
Community commitment

Facebook link for the speech made by the King of Okpekpe, HRH APA Peter Abalume Osigbemeh on the project:

Okpilla community demanding PHC improvement
Project effectiveness is being assessed through a before and after research design approach.

With the results showing effectiveness, we have submitted an LOI for planning the project scaling to the Saving Lives at Birth grant application recently announced by the USAID.

Thankfully, we have scaled the first stage and have now submitted the second stage application with support from the FMOH, WAHO, UNFPA Edo-MOH, EPHCDA, U-Ottawa, U-Louisville, and U-Alabama.
Capacity building components

- Training in research methods and processes – e.g. use of CAPI method of data collection
Capacity building Components

• Theses support for 3 MSc and 1 PhD students at the University of Benin, and 1 PhD student at Ottawa University

• Forthcoming training on social media and ICT – July 26-30, 2018

• Gender training - forthcoming
Conclusion

- The key innovation in this project is to show that strategic community engagement through WDCs can stimulate the use of PHCs by women for skilled pregnancy care.
- When fully informed, communities can drive the process and contribute their own resources for achieving improved PHC delivery.
- Based on this work, it is evident that the community ownership model can succeed in rural communities where poverty, and weak linkages with PHCs and the government hold sway as principal determinants of poor maternal health outcomes.
I thank you all for listening